

WORKINGPAPER

No. 06, 2023

Good Mothers, Bad Mothers: Migrant Ukrainian Women Negotiating to Belong

Alina Penkala, Ilse Derluyn and Ine Lietaert



About the authors

Alina Penkala is a PhD Fellow at Ghent University and UNU-CRIS. Born and raised in Poland, she holds a master's degree in political science from the Jagiellonian University in Krakow. She has worked for the Polish Ministry of Defence as a security policy expert and later in conflict-affected areas, in Georgia for the EU Monitoring Mission, and in Ukraine for the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe (OSCE). She researches return migration and reintegration processes of women returning to Ukraine and focuses on the role of collective memories in their belonging negotiation.

Contact: apenkala@cris.unu.edu

Ilse Derluyn is full professor at the Department of Social Work and Social Pedagogy at Ghent University. Her main research topics concern the psychosocial wellbeing of young refugees and migrants, unaccompanied refugee minors, victims of trafficking and war-affected children, both in the Global North and South. She has widely published and is also active in trainings and support for practitioners and policymakers, and also gives counselling to refugees.

Contact: ilse.derluyn@ugent.be

Ine Lietaert is a Professorial Fellow at UNU-CRIS and coordinator of the Migration and Social Policy Cluster, and an assistant professor at the Department of Social Work and Social Pedagogy at Ghent University where she teaches International Social Work. Her research focuses on the impact of international/regional and national policies on social work and social support practices, with particular focus on the governance of 'mobile' groups in vulnerable situations, such as asylum applicants, return migrants, unaccompanied minors and (internally) displaced persons. She also focus on the impact of mobility and different types of borders and policies on the lives of vulnerable people, including their feeling of belonging, their coping strategies and their access to services, investigated through a socio-spatial research approach.

Contact: ilietaert@cris.unu.edu

About UNU-CRIS

The United Nations University Institute on Comparative Regional Integration Studies (UNU-CRIS) is a research and training institute of the United Nations University, a global network engaged in research and capacity development to support the universal goals of the United Nations and generate new knowledge and ideas. Based in Bruges, UNU-CRIS focuses on the provision of global and regional public goods, and on processes and consequences of intra- and inter-regional integration. The Institute aims to generate policy-relevant knowledge about new patterns of governance and cooperation and build capacity on a global and regional level. UNU-CRIS acts as a resource for the United Nations system, with strong links to other United Nations bodies dealing with the provision and management of international and regional public goods.

The mission of UNU-CRIS is to contribute to generate policy-relevant knowledge about new forms of governance and cooperation on the regional and global level, about patterns of collective action and decision-making.

UNU-CRIS focuses on issues of imminent concern to the United Nations, such as the 2030 Development Agenda and the challenges arising from new and evolving peace, security, economic and environmental developments regionally and globally. On these issues, the Institute will develop solutions based on research on new patterns of collective action and regional and global governance. The Institute endeavours to pair academic excellence with policy-relevant research in these domains.

For more information, please visit www.cris.unu.edu

in alliance with



Abstract

This article examines the connections between socio-political and economic transformations in Ukraine and the discourses surrounding motherhood and migration, specifically focusing on the migratory pattern of female migration to Italy that emerged in the early 1990s. By bringing together fragmented scholarship on gender roles, motherhood, nation-building, and migration, the authors explore the influence of these transformations on discourses of “proper motherhood” and “proper female citizenship.”

We argue that the economic and political transition in Ukraine resulted in a shift in gender roles and ideals of motherhood, and migrant women negotiate the national politics of belonging in response to these discourses. Through a critical literature review, the authors illustrate the complex chain of factors that led to the effects of discourses on the migration of mothers. The article also discusses the reshaping of gender relations in the context of economic and socio-political changes, the shift from mother as a worker to mother, and the role of nation-building in constructing notions of good mothers.

This study contributes to a nuanced understanding of the interplay between gender, migration, and nation-building in post-communist Ukraine.

Keywords

Ukraine, gender roles, motherhood, migration, socio-political transformation, economic transformation, nation-building

Table of Contents

Introduction	3
1. Reshaping of Gender Relations – Economic and Socio-Political Context	3
1.1 From mother as a worker to mother	6
1.2 Nation-building and good mothers	7
2. Migration and Bad Mothers	8
3. Belonging to Good Mothers	9
4. Conclusion	10
5. Bibliography	11

Introduction

Since the fall of communism in the early 1990s, Ukraine experienced many radical changes. The country gained its independence in 1991 and embarked on a painful path of restructuring the economy, marked by a substantial economic downturn and a sharp decline in the standard of living. Ukraine's political transition has been afflicted with corruption and instability, and social unrest led to governments and leadership changes during the "Orange Revolution" of 2004 and the "Revolution of Dignity" of 2014. Throughout the three decades of independence, Ukrainian society paid high costs for the economic and political transition. The Russian military intervention in the east of Ukraine in 2014 and the Russian invasion of Ukraine in 2022 demand an even higher price and sacrifices from Ukrainians.

The geopolitical shifts also influenced mobility and migration. After the fall of communism that restricted the freedom of movement, Ukrainians gained the chance to leave and return to their country. The economic transition created new precarious groups that lost their livelihoods, so migration opened new pathways to solve economic concerns. This chapter focuses on the specific migratory pattern of female migration to Italy that emerged in the early 1990s. Italian ageing society and welfare system architecture created a growing demand for domestic workers and carers, which translated through migration policies into a request for a specific migrant profile of women above 40 years old. From the beginning of the 1990s until 2020 this labour migration route was used by hundreds of thousands of Ukrainian women. As most of them were mothers, media, political debates and academic institutions in Ukraine portrayed their migration as a threat to the stability of both, the Ukrainian nation and its families.

This chapter intends to show the connections between the socio-political and economic transformations that occurred in Ukraine and shaped the discourses surrounding motherhood and migration and, consequently, created a particular discursive field for migrant mothers in Italy. In order to do so, we bring together the often fragmented and disconnected scholarship on gender roles, motherhood, nation building and migration, with the literature on the economic and political transformation in Ukraine to illustrate their influence on discourses on "proper motherhood" and "proper female citizenship". We argue that with a matricentric script of national belonging that surfaced in Ukraine, women who had children and migrated did no longer fit the imposed ideals of motherhood and Ukrainian womanhood and we explore how the migrant women themselves negotiate the national politics of belonging (Yuval-Davis 1997; 2011) and its discourses on "proper motherhood".

The authors begin with a description of gender roles in socialist-era Ukraine to later demonstrate how Ukrainian economic and socio-political transformation resulted in a shift in gender roles. In this first section, we also examine the transition from socialism to capitalism and the concomitant process of nation-building to emphasize the significance of gender in nation-building as a tool in belonging politics (Yuval-Davis 1997; 2011). We highlight how those processes establish the groundwork and context for the second section, where we focus on social discourses on migration. In the third section, we demonstrate how the various narratives of female migrants, justifying their decision to leave, are outcomes of their negotiations of national belonging.

The authors began by conducting a critical literature review of the scholarship on economic and socio-political transformation, gender roles, and Ukrainian migration to picture the complex chain of factors that led to the diachronic effects of discourses on the migration of mothers.

1. Reshaping of Gender Relations – Economic and Socio-Political Context

The history of women's emancipation in the Soviet Union, and specifically in Ukraine, is not straightforward. A historical retrospective shows how women's emancipation had both, a practical and ideological driver. On one hand, the socialist policies were drafted after WWII, while in the Soviet Union, Ukrainians experienced an unprecedented loss of population. Depending on the country, between 14% - 20% of the population perished (Snyder 2010). This loss meant also labour shortages and opportunities for women's employment. Furthermore, throughout the socialist period, legal acknowledgement of the equality of men and women in the labour market was a manifestation of the ideological commitment to class equality and women's emancipation based on the fundamental doctrines of socialism (Ghodsee 2018). It is important not to lose sight of the fact that this reform ended the legal subjugation of women and affected such diverse areas of law as property ownership, citizenship,

divorce (granted at the spouse's or the wife's request), reproductive rights, and the rights of all children (Goldman 1989; Ashwin 2000). The legal recognition was followed by social policies to enable women's employment, those included the provision of childcare facilities, communal cafeterias, school feeding programs for children and communal laundries (Ashwin 2000; Bucur 2008; Inglot 2008). With such a base of state support, women could be incorporated into paid labour. The socialist state considered motherhood as a service to society as a whole – “the highest form of service to one's people and state” (Kaminskii 1936, cited in Issupova 2000: 33) and recognised the need to support their role as mothers and workers (Ghodsee 2018; Funk 2014; Daskalova 2007; Nowak 2018, Bucur 2008).

The way the socialist reform reshaped gender roles in Eastern Europe is denominated by scholars as 'emancipation from above' (Drakulic 2015; Zaharijevic 2015), referring to the fact that emancipation was built-in the communist system and was institutionalised in public life.

Women were still expected to perform domestic work since the government did not challenge the concept that this was a natural role for women to play. As women acquired economic independence and were no longer financially reliant on their male partners for child care, the traditionally masculine roles of father and provider were likewise changed. Given that fathers no longer played their “traditional role as a provider” (Issupova 2000: 34) as the state took over that supportive role, fathers were marginalized in everyday family life (Issupova 2000; Kiblitkaya 2000).

However, the picture of steady progress and improvement of women's political, economic and social rights under socialism/communism needs to be nuanced. There was a stark contrast between the gender emancipatory ideals of socialism and the reality of the socialist/communist state. It was a life in a totalitarian regime, characterised by lack and inefficiencies, with struggles for most basic goods, rationed food, no travel, and no political freedom (Heumos 2010). Still, the material situation of women had improved and led to economic independence from men (Jarska 2018; Nowak 2004; Funk 2014; Ghodsee 2018; Ghodsee and Mean 2018), something that radically changed with the economic transformation to capitalism, as we will show below, one of the direct and visible outcomes of the transformation for women was the shift in “dependence” – from dependence on the state under socialism to the “dependence” on men in capitalism (Gal & Kligman 2000).

The fall of communism in 1991, the creation of a new state and the creation of a new economic order was a critical moment in the history of Ukraine and its political, ideological and economic significance cannot be understated. A vast literature on the political and economic transformation in Eastern Europe exists, much of it addressing the economic fallout caused by the early years' reforms and its consequences on society (Lane 2013; Sallai & Schnyder 2019; Molodikova 2008). It shows how the transition from the centrally planned economy to a market economy was followed by a deep market crisis, bankruptcies of state-owned companies and factories, cuts in public sector employment and limits to its services, with consequences such as mass unemployment and state's dereliction of most basic services such as free education and health care system (Hartwell 2016). However, relevant here, is how these transformative political, economic and cultural changes also brought new conceptualizations of gender order.

1.1. From mother as a worker to mother

New reforms introduced the market into state-owned businesses and public services and restructured welfare with profound implications for workers and users alike. The uneven way of restructuring was reflected in the uneven distributional impacts of transformation in terms of regions, social class and gender. Some of the transformation processes that affected female employment were unintended, such as bankruptcies in manufacturing, the textile industry and restructuring in agriculture. Also, highly educated women were affected, as many lost their jobs in public administration, academic institutions and party-related institutions (Hrycak 2001). In early 1990, there were welfare protections for women introduced, namely maternity leave and rights to preserve employment while on leave, legal protection against unjustified refusal to hire and unlawful dismissal. However, with 49% of the Ukrainian economy described as a shadow economy (Johnson, Kaufmann and Shleifer 1997, p. 183) and 70% of the shadow economy made up of women (Martsenyuk 2015), one can conclude that the social protection for women existed only on a paper.

At the same time, with most day-care centres and kindergartens closed, women lost access to affordable childcare. The state

tried to compensate for the unavailable childcare services by extending formal maternity leave provisions. For politicians, these policies helped to reduce the unemployment rates and saved money (Saxonberg & Sirovatka 2006). Moreover, women were kept out of certain positions by employers because of a belief that family responsibilities would make them unreliable workers (Chepurko 2010). Despite being on average better educated than men, they were employed primarily in low-status, unskilled, low-paying jobs in manufacturing, agriculture and retail. Clearly, many labour laws provisions that the Ukrainian state implemented in the early 1990s were designed with the assumption that all women are mothers or future mothers with family, childcare and care duties.

A good example of such labour policy is *The Longterm Programme for the Improvement of the Situation of Women and Family, Maternity and Childhood Protection*, approved by the Cabinet of Ministers of Ukraine Resolution in 1992 and the *Programme for the Release of Women from Production Requiring Hard Work and the Restriction of the Employment of Women for Night Work* in 1996. Those policies were recognized by the government as a top priority measure for improving women's working conditions (Chepurko 2010). However, they mandated the removal of women from industrial jobs involving manual labour, placed limitations on women working nightshifts, ordered the removal of women from positions in iron processing, foundries, galvanic and etching works, nickel and chromium plating, ferrous metallurgy, furniture manufacturing and driving trucks, and cancelling the training of women for these positions. Before those regulations took place, women's employment in those positions was twice that of men. The state's intention to protect women in their role as mothers, and even as future mothers, was translated into a policy that took away their right to pursue employment opportunities of their choosing (Antonovych 2001). Explicitly, the legal provision, written in a pronatalist language of 'protecting motherhood', essentialising mothers and fixing them to that status (Scott 2020), represents the linguistic shift from 'mothers as workers' to 'mothers' reinstating their maternal function.

Within this context, the pronatalist narratives in Ukraine reinstated the ideal of a mother at home with a child and reinstalled the idea of a woman being dependent on a man. Attention to women's reproductive role in the discourse of policy-makers referred to mothers as the key to family stability overshadowed the previously dominant image of a working woman with children from the socialist time (Riley 1981; Zhurzenko 2001a; Kis 2005). Undoubtedly, demographic anxieties felt in Ukraine reinforced pronatalist policies and discourse. Concerns over biological and social reproduction create an environment where the conduct of women, and mothers, in particular, becomes the focus of the policymakers (Sobotka 2011; Petrova and Inglot 2020; Okolski 2012; Iglicka 2017; Duvander, Lappegard, Andersson 2010). The population of Ukraine shrank between 1990-2010 from 51.8 to 45.9 million (Basten & Frejka 2017). Ageing of the population, migration and declining fertility, and high mortality rates seem to be pressing challenges. Those challenges were often politicised and contributed to nationalistic rhetoric, sometimes expressed as antimigration rhetoric in case the migrants were women, expressed in almost daily attention of media, political debates or even academia in Ukraine to portray departures as having a devastating effect on families. The migration of women challenged the foundation of the nation-state and the family (Gapova 2002; Kasic 2002).

1.2. Nation-building and good mothers

Ukraine is a prime example of how national projects influence gender relations by defining specific notions of man and woman, and therefore instituting national politics of belonging that construct the boundaries of that belonging, admitting some and excluding others (Yuval-Davis 2011; 86-94).

The resurfacing of the Berehynia myth, a forgotten story of a *pagan goddess-protector of women, a family and a home*, is illustrative of the reinvention of a new nationally rooted model of femininity. Berehynia as an ideal Ukrainian woman was quickly popularised by patriotic novels praising the goddess, as "the eternal guardian of Ukrainian traditional values, national culture and ethnic identity" (Kis 2005 p.). Furthermore, the Ukrainian nationalistic discourses focused on the mythology of 'the Ukrainian matriarchal culture' as the origin of the nation, claiming that in this original society, both men and women lived in 'equality in difference', having complementary and highly regarded roles. Having a specific model to construct their identity around (Berehynia), women embraced motherhood as a new natural and most important role. This image contributed significantly to establishing a discourse on proper motherhood, delineating good Ukrainian mothers and othering mothers, who chose to care for children differently. From this representation comes the idea that Ukraine is a newborn child that needs women's care. In such discursive narratives' women became essential to the nation-building project (Zhurzenko 2001b; Rubchak 1996; Kis 2005).

This ideology has been operationalised into calls for women to subordinate their interests to the universal ‘interests of the nation’, starting from the beginning of nation-building in 1991 (Zhurzenko 2001b). The Ukrainian women’s movement embraced this narrative and professed the subjection of their fight for women’s rights to the universal goals of state-building. The national women’s organizations decided to wait with demands for equal rights until Ukrainian statehood would be stable and strong. Such sacrifice of self-interests for collective goals was acceptable as it sounded familiar, almost an echo of the communist rhetoric often applied in the past decades (Zhurzenko 2001b, Hrycak 2007).

The swift emergence and mainstreaming of the new nationalist/conservative ideology of traditional family and gender roles are often framed by scholars as a backlash and delegitimization of Soviet policy of women’s emancipation (Ghodsee 2018; Gal & Klingman 2000). The emphasis was laid on the autonomy of the family and the symbolic link of Family-Nation (Yuval Davis 1997).

This rhetoric focuses on a specific Ukrainian family tradition as a fundamental Ukrainian ethnos, and consequently, the revival of the nation in the newly independent state is a task for the mothers.

Within families, mothers nurture the national identity, Ukrainian language and culture. Biological and social reproduction is the main women’s purpose as even the women’s movement has defined women’s interests as the interest of the mother. Directed by this self-sacrifice logic, women’s decisions should only be guided by the “good” of the family, children and the nation (Kis 2005). As Yuval-Davis’ (2011) shows, the politics of belonging is deciding who is inside and who is outside the imaginary borders. When motherhood as a sacrifice became an official state ideology and Berehynia a model of femininity, the women who did not submit to the belief that the only self-fulfilment for a woman is to be a domestic matriarch in service of the patriarchal nation-state (Rubchak 2009) were excluded from the national belonging. In what follows we show how this version of ideal womanhood interacts with the discourses on female migration.

2. Migration and Bad Mothers

In Ukraine, the female migration flow to Italy created an avalanche of gendered nationalist outcry. Discourses condemning ‘migration of mothers’ by political actors, media, church, civil society and academia were dominant (Fedyuk 2011; Vianello 2016; Solari 2010; Keryk 2004). This aligns with a broader trend where migrant mothers are judged by society as displaying deviant maternal behaviour. Mothers who violate the traditional – Berehynian concept of motherhood by migrating or just seeking paid employment must be prepared for the judgements of others as well as their feelings of ambivalence and guilt over “abandoning” their children (Arendell 1999, 2000). The rigorous societal, cultural, and familial standards, which prescribe a very narrow conception of motherhood, can generate a sense of being trapped in a layer of competing and contradictory expectations of what a “good mother” or “good nurturing” looks like.

In Ukraine, the public discourse produces an image of migrant mothers as women who abandon the duties of motherhood. The presence of the pronatalist discourse on “protecting motherhood” only reinforces this public judgment. In early 2000, for example, President Kuchma called all Ukrainian women in migration “whores” (Fedyuk 2011). The next president Yushchenko and his government launched a campaign of media commercials, where a series of billboards and TV advertisements suggested that Ukrainian women go abroad to work as prostitutes and those who do not go there in such capacity, will likely end up as victims of sex trafficking (Solari 2014). Yet, contrary to the representations in the advertisements, the female migrants to Italy were older women working in the domestic and care sector and sex workers constituted a small percentage of the labour migration to Italy (Hrycak 2011; Molodikova 2008).

It is interesting to observe that the rhetoric employed by politicians in Ukraine to discourage female migration by labelling them as “prostitutes” was not their invention. A decade before, in the early 1990s, anti-trafficking initiatives had already sparked this rhetoric and used similar language (Hrycak 2006, 2007). Transnational advocacy networks frequently utilize “shame mobilization” as a method to influence national governments, by calling out or “shaming” their policies or lack thereof, in front of an international audience (Keck and Sikkink 1998). They employ the power of shame to bring the situation of trafficked women to the attention of governments, international organizations, and wider social audiences. Women’s sex anti-trafficking campaigns in Ukraine began during the country’s integration into the global economy and mass migration in the early 1990s (Hughes &

Denisova 2003) as the sex trade and sex trafficking networks started operating in post-communist countries and put migrant women in danger. The anti-trafficking programs in Ukraine aimed to reduce such risks (Shapkina 2008), however, they created a discourse about sex trafficking in Ukraine as widespread and nothing short of a national crisis. The anti-trafficking campaigns in Ukraine produced their own widely distributed advertisements for the mobilization of shame and over the course of a decade, the stories about trafficked women dominated the national discourse creating a migration/prostitution nexus (Hrycak 2006). Since then, migration would automatically be connected with prostitution, increasing social control over migrants through the disciplinary power of narratives (Shapkina 2008). It became so-called common knowledge that many women ever since had to cope not only with the difficulty of migration but also with the burden of suspicion and shame in their home country (Fedyuk 2012).

Many factors contributed to the public's strong reaction to this discourse. There were mothers who "abandoned" their children, women who crossed gender boundaries, and women's migration contributed to the demographic problem. As a result, it matched nicely with nationalist myths about the importance of women for the nation's existence, in which mothers who contributed to the nation's growth became heroes, while those who contributed to its decline became traitors (Yuval-Davis 1998). Ukraine is not an exception in stigmatising female migration. It is a well-documented phenomenon in the literature (Parrenas 2005, Åkesson, Carling, and Drotbohm 2012), and it demonstrates how female migration crosses gender boundaries. It strengthens women's economic power vis-a-vis men and removes mothers from the domestic sphere. The pressure from the state, schools, social workers, and churches to maintain the nuclear family and prescribe a rigorous version of traditional family roles not only condemns "migrants' family arrangements as aberrant, dangerous, and unwelcome", but also ignores all of these practices (Parrenas 2005:30). It also gives no credit to migrant women's major contribution to their families, local and national economy. In the situation of migration, these gender conventions work against both, men and women. In a society where men are expected to be successful breadwinners and the heads of the family, any failure to meet those demands/obligations is seen as a flaw in their character and a symptom of a lack of masculinity rather than a structural economic problem. Similarly, even though the primary motive for leaving is to support the home and children left behind, a woman who migrates to work is no longer regarded as a good mother (Parrenas 2005a).

3. Belonging to Good Mothers

The women who left Ukraine for Italy do not ignore or stay out of this discursive field. They construct narratives and use them to satisfy different interlocutors (Solari 2014). All the narratives women tell negotiate the image produced by the mainstream discourse of them as mothers who abandon the duties of motherhood. Their stories are the attempt to renegotiate their status, assigned to all women in the politics of belonging, where they are considered the objects and agents of the state practices, the biological reproducers of the nation and cultural reproducers of the ethnic group (Yuval-Davis 1997). In the negotiation of their belonging to the desired group of "good mothers", their motherhood and mothering practices are at the centre. The individual stories of women are told in a way to conform to particular narratives and illustrate the mechanism of disciplinary power of discourses and politics of belonging (Yuval-Davis 1997; 2011). Within the research examining the migration of Ukrainian women to Italy, two major narratives have been identified as negotiation tools used by mothers to renegotiate their "proper motherhood" and "proper citizenship."

The first one is the **poverty narrative** (Solari 2014) or **sacrifice narrative** (Tyldum 2015, Fedyuk 2015, Vianello 2016; Tolstokorova 2010) where the economic hardship in Ukraine gives women no choice but to leave for Italy where they suffer difficult living conditions, doing 'low status' cleaning and care work and missing their family. Migration is constructed as economically forced and difficult but they willingly sacrifice their well-being for the good of the family. The concept of sacrifice for them is fundamental to reinventing their story in morally justifiable terms. Given the ideologies of mothering and respectable femininity in Ukraine, women report poverty as a reason for migrating as mothers only leave children behind when it's an absolute necessity for their survival. They explain they migrated not to make their life better but to make their families' lives better. The hardship of a migrant's life is a 'sacrifice' for children and grandchildren and their better life in Ukraine. The family back home accepts the narrative and values monetary remittances as evidence of their sacrifice (Solari 2014). It is Vianello in her ethnographic research in Italy and Ukraine who noticed that the narratives that women use to explain migration are often based on the idea of a brave mother, a combination of the Soviet mother-worker and Berehynia, the pillar of the family and society, in

contrast to that of the weak man, an idler unable to fulfil his family duties as a breadwinner (Vianello 2016). She points out that the female migrants use the same images of motherhood and care to contradict the mainstream discourse accusing them of being *bad mothers and dissident wives* by insisting that it's a duty of a mother to put her interest aside and secure the future of her children (see also Solari 2010; Tyldum 2015). They insist that family function never ends and defy the assumption that mothering stops because of physical distance. Those women challenge the imposed version of traditional family and family roles and reject the idea that there is a rupture and abandonment, insisting that they are caring and nurturing mothers and they come up with arrangements of doing just that.

Other researchers showed how some women rejected the poverty discourse and constructed an **aspirational narrative** (Solari 2018), migration for a **better life narrative** (Tyldum 2015; Fedyuk 2012). The economic reason for migration was still used but the meaning of the migration experience was framed in terms of love, caring and self-transformation and not sacrifice and duty. In Solari's (2018; 2010; 2014) work the aspirational narrative is very pronounced and she insists that through the self-transformation migrants believed they could send back to Ukraine European ideas, practices and values as well as market-based, capitalist know-how in the form of *social remittances*. Their driving force to persist in doing the exhausting work in domestic and care sectors, staying away and missing the family was to learn what it means to be European and pass it on. Even monetary remittances were given meanings of European values and status, as children were instructed to focus on education and pursue new, in the Ukrainian context, jobs in business and marketing, considered by the migrants themselves as a European path. Women pursued their integration strategies by engaging with culture, museums, and learning the Italian language all to later make Ukraine more European (Solari 2018). There is an echo of the nationalist rhetoric of *mothers of the nation* and their responsibility for the nation and the country.

These mothers insisted on being regarded as *good mothers* because the reason for their absence is their love and desire for their children's better future. The way these aspirational narratives were constructed, women were not only focused on the experience for their children and family – pursuing better education and achieving a successful career in the future – but they also cared about Ukraine and wished for it to be a prosperous and democratic country. Their children would be contributing to that end by being competent and successful citizens.

This narrative was a rebuttal of mainstream discourses on *proper motherhood* and *proper citizenship*. Women in their own eyes considered themselves good mothers and no boundary of the politics of belonging would cast them outside that group.

Another variation of the aspirational story depicts Italy as a country that offers prospects for a better life (Tyldum 2015). Migration is not presented as a solution to structural economic problems, but rather as an individual response to a personal problem at home. Women move to Italy in search of happiness or a better life, suggesting that they remained if there were compelling reasons to do so. This narrative demonstrates that despite the significance of motherhood in the narratives of migrants, mobility provides other experiences and possibilities (Fedyuk 2011).

Conclusion

This chapter has highlighted how a political economic lens allows tracing the concurrent processes of socio-political transformation and nation-state building and its influence on the discursive landscape of gender, motherhood and migration. This approach allowed us to show motherhood as a historical experience, influenced by economic systems, social policies and nation-state building, and not merely shaped by personal experiences of women.

The transformation in Ukraine proved to be a fascinating example to observe how the understanding of women's roles, from empowered and employed women in Soviet times to women that leave those "gains" behind and embrace mothering duties, care for children and the nation is connected to the politics of belonging of the new Ukrainian nation-state. Migrant mothers were not included within the boundaries of belonging and we demonstrated how the idealized trope of motherhood, embedded in Ukrainian national discourses, set the dynamic of their lives. We showed how in this particular discursive field migrant mothers needed to position themselves and negotiate their belonging. They use a palette of different narratives to be considered worthy and sacrificing mothers and their personal stories are shaped to conform to the discourses on proper motherhood, which illustrates the mechanism of disciplinary power of discourses and politics of belonging (Yuval-Davis 1997; 2011). Still,

the narratives of Ukrainian mothers in Italy did not admit a defeat in belonging to good mothers, “mothers of the nation”, they moved the archive of mothering to a place that considered them as caring and nurturing, proving their sacrifice and commitment to maternal duty.

Bibliography

- Ashwin, S. (ed.) (2000). *Gender, State and Society in Soviet and Post-Soviet Russia*. London: Routledge.
- Akesson, L., Carling, J., and Drotbohm, H. (2012). “Mobility, Moralities and Motherhood: Navigating the Contingencies of Cape Verdean Lives”, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(1), pp. 237-260.
- Antonovych, M. (2001). “Women’s Rights, Paritary Rights and Rule of Law in Ukraine”, *Ius Gentium: Journal of the University of Baltimore*, 7 (‘Paritary Rights’), pp. 31-35.
- Arendell, T. (1999). “Mothering and Motherhood: A Decade Review”, *Journal of Marriage and the Family*, Special Issue: Decade Reviews, Working Paper 3/66.
- Arendell, T. (2000). “Conceiving and Investigating Motherhood: The Decade’s Scholarship”, *Journal of Marriage and Family* 62 (4), pp. 1192-207. Last Accessed 13 June, 2023. Available at: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/1566731>.
- Basten, S., and Frejka, T. (2015). “Fertility and Family Policies in Central and Eastern Europe”. *Social Research*, 15(1), Oxford University Department of Social Policy and Intervention Working Paper.
- Balcerowicz, L. (1995). *Socialism, capitalism, transformation*. Budapest: Central European University Press.
- Bucur, M. (2008). “An Archipelago of Stories: Gender History in Eastern Europe”, *The American Historical Review*, 113 (5), pp. 1375–1389. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1086/ahr.113.5.1375>.
- Chepurko, G. (2010). “Gender Equality in the Labour Market in Ukraine”. International Labour Office, ILO Decent Work Technical Support Team and Country Office for Central and Eastern Europe. Kyiv: ILO, 2010.
- Cerwonka, A. (2008). “Traveling Feminist Thought: Difference and Transculturation in Central and Eastern European Feminism”, *Signs* 33(4), pp. 809-32. Accessed 5 May, 2021. Doi: 10.1086/528852.
- Cvajner, M. (2020). “Women Migration, Unexpected Intimacies and Emerging Lovescares. The Experience of Post-Soviet Migrant Women Pioneers in Italy”, *Sociologia E Politiche Sociali*, 3, pp. 113-134.
- Cvajner, M. (2012). “The Presentation of Self in Emigration: Eastern European Women in Italy”, *Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, 642, pp. 186-199.
- Duvander, A.Z., Lappegard, T., and Andersson, G. (2010). “Family Policy and Fertility: Fathers’ and Mothers’ Use of Parental Leave and Continued Childbearing in Norway and Sweden”, *Journal of European Social Policy*, 20(1), pp. 45-57.
- Fedyuk, O. (2011). “Beyond Motherhood: Ukrainian Female Labour Migration to Italy”. Budapest: Central European University, Department of Sociology and Social Anthropology.
- Fedyuk, O. (2012). “Images of Transnational Motherhood: The Role of Photographs in Measuring Time and Maintaining Connections between Ukraine and Italy”, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 38(2), pp. 279-300. Doi: 10.1080/1369183X.2012.646422
- Fedyuk, O. (2015). “Growing Up With Migration: Shifting Roles and Responsibilities of Transnational Families of Ukrainian Care Workers in Italy”, in M. Kontos and G. T. Bonifacio (eds.), *Migrant Domestic Workers and Family Life. Migration, Diasporas and Citizenship Series*. London: Palgrave Macmillan. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137323552_6.
- Fedyuk, O. (2016). “The Gender Perspective in Ukrainian Migration”, in O. Fedyuk, M. Kindler (eds), *Ukrainian Migration to the European Union*. IMISCOE Research Series. Cham: Springer. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-41776-9_5
- Funk, N. (2014). “A Very Tangled Knot: Official State Socialist Women’s Organizations, Women’s Agency and Feminism in Eastern European State Socialism”, *European Journal of Women’s Studies*, 21 (4), pp. 344–60.
- Gal, S. & Kligman, G. (2000). *Reproducing Gender: Politics, Publics, and Everyday Life After Socialism*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

- Gapova, E. (2002). "On Nation, Gender, and Class Formation in Belarus ... and Elsewhere in the Post-Soviet World", *Nationalities Papers*, 30(4), pp. 639-662. Doi: 10.1080/00905992.2002.10540511.
- Ghodsee, K. (2018a). *Why Women Have Better Sex Under Socialism: And Other Arguments for Economic Independence* (New York: Nation Books).
- Ghodsee, Kristen. (2018b). "Crashing the Party: The Radical Legacy of a Soviet-Era Feminist", *World Policy Journal*, 35 (2), pp. 70-74. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1215/07402775-7085877>.
- Ghodsee, Kirsten, and Mead, J. (2018b). "What Has Socialism Ever Done for Women?", *Catalyst*, 2(2), pp. 101-133.
- Goldman, W. (1989) "Women, the Family and the New Revolutionary Order in the Soviet Union", in S. Kurks, R. Rapp and M. B. Young (eds.), *Promissory Notes: Women in the Transition to Socialism*. New York: Monthly Review Press, pp. 59 – 81.
- Hartwell, C.A. (2016). *Two Roads Diverge: The Transition Experience of Poland and Ukraine*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Doi: 10.1017/CBO9781316282373.
- Heumos, P. (2010). "Workers under Communist Rule: Research in the Former Socialist Countries of Eastern-Central and South-Eastern Europe and in the Federal Republic of Germany", *International Review of Social History*, 55(1), pp. 83-115.
- Hrycak, A. (2001). "The Dilemmas of Civic Revival: Ukrainian Women since Independence", *Journal of Ukrainian Studies*, 26(1/2), pp. 135-158.
- Hrycak, A. (2006). "Foundation Feminism and the Articulation of Hybrid Feminisms in Post-Socialist Ukraine", *East European Politics and Societies*, 20(1), pp. 69-100. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0888325405284249>.
- Hrycak, A. (2007). "From Global to Local Feminisms: Transnationalism, Foreign Aid and the Women's Movement in Ukraine", in S. Sarker (ed.), *Sustainable Feminisms (Advances in Gender Research, Vol. 11)*. Bingley: Emerald Group Publishing Limited, pp. 75-93. Available at: [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1529-2126\(07\)11005-5](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1529-2126(07)11005-5).
- Hrycak, A. (2011). "Women as Migrants on the Margins of the European Union", in M.J. Rubchak (ed.), *Mapping Difference: The Many Faces of Women in Contemporary Ukraine*. New York: Berghahan Books, pp. 47-64.
- Hughes, D., and Denisova, T. (2003). *Trafficking in Women from Ukraine*. U.S. Department of Justice report carried out by the International Centre of the U.S. National Institute of Justice and the Ukrainian Academy of Legal Sciences.
- Jarska, N. (2018). "A Patriarchal Marriage? The Women's Movement and the Communist Party in Poland (1945-1989)", *Kwartalnik Historyczny*, 125(2), pp. 7-37.
- Iglicka, K. (2017). "Central Europe Dying Out?", *Aspen Review Central Europe*, 15 March 2017. Praga: Aspen Institute Prague. Available at: <https://www.aspen.review/article/2017/central-europe-dying-out%3f/>.
- Johnson, S., Kaufmann D., and Shleifer A. (1997). "The Unofficial Economy in Transition", *Brookings Papers on Economic Activity*, 2, pp. 159-239.
- Kašić, B. (2002). "The Dynamic of Identifications within Nationalistic Discourse: From Archetypes to Promising Female Roles", *From Gender to Nation*, 2002, pp. 189-200.
- Keck, M.E., and Sikkink, K. (1998). *Activists Beyond Borders: Advocacy Networks in International Politics*. Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press. Available at: <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.7591/j.ctt5hh13f>.
- Keryk, M. (2004). "Labour Migrant: Our Savior or Betrayer? Ukrainian Discussions Concerning Labour Migration", *Migration Online*, 31 October, 2004. Available at: <https://migrationonline.cz/en/e-library/labour-migrant-our-savior-or-betrayer-ukrainian-discussions-concerning-labour-migration>.
- Kis, O. (2005). "Choosing Without Choice: Predominant Models of Femininity in Contemporary Ukraine", in M. Hurd, H. Carlback and S. Rastback (eds.), *Gender Transitions in Russia and Eastern Europe*. Stockholm: Gondolin Publishers, pp. 105-136.
- Lane, D. (2013). *The Capitalist Transformation of State Socialism: The Making and Breaking of State Socialist Society, and What Followed (1st ed.)*. London: Routledge. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203739853>.
- Martsenyuk, T. (2015). "Gender Issues in Ukraine: Were the EuroMaidan Protests Patriarchal or Egalitarian?", in Heinrich Böll Foundation (ed.), *Anti-Gender Movements on the Rise? Strategising for Gender Equality in Central and Eastern Europe*. Berlin: Heinrich Böll Stiftung. Retrieved from <https://www.boell.de/sites/default/files/2015-04-anti-gender-movements-on-the-rise.pdf>.
- Molodikova, I. (2008). *Trends in the Field of Social Policies and Welfare Reforms in Ukraine and Moldova*. Ricerca condotta nell'ambito del Progetto 'Lavoro di cura e internazionalizzazione del welfare: Scenari Transnazionali del Welfare del futuro', Background Report 3/2008. Roma: CeSPI.
- Nowak, B. (2004). *Serving Women and the State. The League of Women in Communist Poland*. PhD dissertation. Columbus, OH: Ohio State University.

- Okólski, M. (2012). *Demographic Challenges in Central and Eastern Europe at the Turn of the Century*. Centre of Migration Research, presentation, October 24–25, 2012.
- Parreñas, R.S. (2005). "The Gender Paradox in the Transnational Families of Filipino Migrant Women", *Asian and Pacific Migration Journal*, 14(3), pp. 243–68. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1177/011719680501400301>.
- Petrova, T., and Inglot, T. (2020) "Introduction: Politics and Current Challenges of Demography in Central and Eastern Europe", *East European Politics and Societies*, 34(4), pp. 879–92. Available at: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0888325420905886>.
- Riley, D. (1981) "'The Free Mothers': Pronatalism and Working Women in Industry at the End of the Last War in Britain", *History Workshop Journal*, 1(1), pp. 59–119.
- Rubchak, M. (1996). "Christian virgin or pagan goddess: feminism versus the eternally feminine in Ukraine", in R. Marsh (ed.), *Women in Russia and Ukraine*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, pp. 315–330.
- Rubchak, Marian J. (2009). "Ukraine's Ancient Matriarch as a Topos in Constructing a Feminine Identity", *Feminist Review*, 92, pp. 129–150. Available at: <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1057/fr.2009.5>.
- Saxonberg, S., and Sirovátka, T. (2006). "Failing Family Policy in Post-Communist Central Europe", *Journal of Comparative Policy Analysis: Research and Practice*, 8(2), pp. 185–202. Doi: 10.1080/13876980600682089.
- Sallai, D., and Schnyder, G. (2018). "The Transformation of Post-Socialist Capitalism – From Developmental State to Clan State?", *Greenwich Paper in Political Economy*, GPERC57.
- Scott, J.W. (2020). "'The Red Heart of Truth': On Denise Riley's Critical Feminism", *Feminist Theory*, 21(3), pp. 267–273.
- Shapkina, N. (2008). *Operation Help: Counteracting Sex Trafficking of Women from Russia and Ukraine*. Dissertation. Atlanta, GE: Georgia State University. Available at: https://scholarworks.gsu.edu/sociology_diss/35.
- Snyder, T. (2010). *Bloodlands: Europe Between Hitler and Stalin*. New York, NY: Basic Books.
- Sobotka, T., Skirbekk, V., and Philipov, D. (2011). "Economic Recession and Fertility in the Developed World", *Population and Development Review*, 27(2), pp. 267–306.
- Solari, C. (2010). *Exile vs. Exodus: Nationalism and Gendered Migration from Ukraine to Italy and California*. PhD dissertation. Berkeley, CA: University of California.
- Solari, C. (2014) "'Prostitutes' and 'Defectors': How the Ukrainian State Constructs Women Emigrants to Italy and the USA", *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 40(11), pp. 1817–1835.
- Solari, C.D. "Transnational Moral Economies: The Value of Monetary and Social Remittances in Transnational Families", *Current Sociology*, 67(5), pp. 760–777.
- Tolstokorova, A. (2010). "Where Have All the Mothers Gone? The Gendered Effect of Labour Migration and Transnationalism on the Institution of Parenthood in Ukraine", *Anthropology of East Europe Review*, 28(1), *Special Issue: Gender in Post-socialist Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union*, "Special Issue Section 3: Gendered Migrations".
- Tyldum, G. (2015). "Motherhood, Agency and Sacrifice in Narratives on Female Migration for Care Work", *Sociology*, 49(1), pp. 56–71.
- Vianello, F.A. (2016). "Migration of Ukrainian Nationals to Italy: Women on the Move", in O. Fedyuk and M. Kindler (eds.), *Ukrainian Migration to the European Union*. IMISCOE Research Series. Berlin: Springer
- Yuval-Davis, N. (1997). "Women, Citizenship and Difference", *Feminist Review*, 57(1), pp. 4–27.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (2016). "Power, Intersectionality and the Politics of Belonging", in W. Harcourt (ed.), *The Palgrave Handbook of Gender and Development*. London: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Zaharijevic, A. (2015). "Fantasies of feminist history in Eastern Europe", *Eurozine*, 31 July 2015. Available at: <https://www.eurozine.com/fantasies-of-feminist-history-in-eastern-europe/>.
- Zhurzhenko, T. (2001a). "Free Market Ideology and New Women's Identities in Post-Socialist Ukraine", *European Journal of Women's Studies*, 8 (1), pp. 29–49.
- Zhurzhenko, T. (2001b). "Ukrainian feminism(s): Between nationalist myth and anti-nationalist critique", *IWM Working Paper 4*. International Monetary Fund.

Good Mothers, Bad Mothers: Migrant Ukrainian Women Negotiating to
Belong

UNU-CRIS Working Paper #6 2023

Copyright © United Nations University Institute on Comparative Regional
Integration Studies 2023

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do
not necessarily reflect the views of the United Nations University.
Published by: United Nations University Institute on Comparative
Regional Integration Studies

Cover image: UN Women/Flickr